



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	British Journal of Applied Science & Technology
Manuscript Number:	2013_BJAST_5776
Title of the Manuscript:	Effects of water hyacinth (Eichhornia crassipes [mart.] solms) compost on growth and yield parameters of maize (Zea mays) in the Lake Victoria Basin
Type of the Article	Research Paper

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	1. List of abbreviation should be listed. 2. There is no physical, chemical and biological characteristics which include nutrients (N, P,K) for each compost. 3. There is no reference for analysis methods used in the soil study. 4. Table 12: texture S:L: C 20:80:0/A, 40:60:0 B/ 20:20:60 C. The authors claim that an increase in the fertilizer cause the high holding capacity of water, however, we believe that the major effect for the water holding is attributed to the increase of the clay percentage in the soil. 5. The effect of pH for the three kinds of soil should be reported because the pH has a significant effect on the plant growth. 6. Soil characteristics after harvesting should be reported to examine the effect of the different composites. 7. Chemical analysis for the different ions such as N, P and K in each plant part should be reported.	1. The list has now been provided. 2. The physical and chemical characteristics of the compost have now been provided in section 3.7. 3. The methods used for soil analysis have now been mentioned as described in reference 18 under section 2.5. 4. We concur with you that clay soil majorly accounts for water holding capacity. However, compost also adds organic matter that improves the moisture retention ability of the soil thus a contributing factor too. 5. pH has been given as a factor that probably contributed to the varied plant growth in various farms in the discussion. 6. We are of the opinion that the effects of water hyacinth compost on soil characteristics be reported in an independent paper. 7. The analysis of various plant parts was not carried out in this study.



SDI Review Form 1.6

		We appreciate the idea and this would form part of our future work.
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments	Minor Revision	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		We highly appreciate your input and comments toward improving this paper and we hope that all comments have been addressed satisfactorily.